## Cash Balance Plan Update

What is current and upcoming with the fastest growing retirement plan segment

## March 14, 2023

Judd Depew, President
The Pension Design Group
614.264.4676
judd@pensiondesigngroup.com

## The Pension Design Group

Focused on minimizing tax liability and increasing retirement savings for business owners.

Full-service compliance firm providing customized plan design, administration, and actuarial services for Plan Sponsors in partnership with Financial Advisors

Provide compliance \& administration to almost 1,000 qualified retirement plans

## Great

 growth inCash
Balance Plans

- Double digit growth in number of CB Plans almost every year dating back to early 2000
- Cash Balance Plan assets now exceed $\$ 1$ Trillion
- $94 \%$ of Cash Balance Plans have < than 100 participants
- $59 \%$ of Cash Balance Plans have < than 10 participants
- Healthcare, Professional Services, Finance/Insurance, and Construction represent $67 \%$ of all Cash Balance Plans

[^0]
## Why are these popular again?

EGTRRA - significant increase in combined plan deduction limit and increase in maximum DB benefit

> IRS Cash Balance regulations - clarity and expanded options for Interest Crediting Rates

Tax Cuts and Jobs Act
(Section 199A) - helps owners reduce their AGI to obtain additional 199A deduction

Secure Act 2.0 -
expanded tax credits to $100 \%$ over 3 years PLUS up to $\$ 1,000$ credit for employer contributions.

PPA - another increase in combined plan deduction limit

Final IRS Cash Balance regulations - greater investment flexibility and option to use fixed rates up to $6 \%$

Secure Act - permitted retroactive adoption of DC and CB plans. 50\% tax credits for startup plans over first 3 years.

## What is a Cash Balance Plan?

- A type of a Defined Benefit Plan
- Provides for an annual allocation defined in Plan Document (usually as a $\%$ of compensation or a specific amount). Can have different allocation formulas for different employees or groups
- Provides for an annual interest credit defined in Plan document. Makes sense to use a fixed rate of interest
- Does not make sense to use an interest rate greater than $5.50 \%$ as that results in a lower lump sum limit.


## About Defined Benefit and Cash Balance Plans



- Subject to minimum funding requirements
- Annual contribution for a participant is not directly limited but maximum lump sum payable is limited based upon:
- Compensation history
- Plan participation history
- Age
- Usually work backwards from maximum lump sum to determine maximum contribution on behalf of a participant
- Must offer annuity form of payment (rarely elected)


## Why Cash Balance?



- Higher Contributions possible than in $401(\mathrm{k})$ or other Defined Contribution Plans
- Tax Deductible and ERISA creditor protection
- Value of tax deduction and deferral likely to increase considering potential higher income and investment tax rates
- Increase retirement benefits for employees (paid for by tax benefits to owners)


## Why Cash Balance Instead of Traditional Defined Benefit?



- COMMUNICATION
- Easy for participants to understand (benefit is a lump sum amount instead of monthly amount payable for life beginning in retirement)
- AGE NEUTRAL FOR STAFF
- Can provide age neutral benefits (employees of different ages but same compensation can receive same allocation)
- INCREASED FLEXIBILITY
- Increased flexibility if annual allocation is based upon current compensation.
- CONSISTENT BENEFIT GROWTH
- Lump Sum amounts do not fluctuate based upon changes in Treasury or Corporate Bond yields


## Cash Balance Plans make sense for

- Not everyone but are often a fit for:
- Medical or Dental Groups
- Sole Proprietors
- Professional Firms (CPA, Attorney, Engineers, Architects, Investment Advisors)
- Small closely held business
- Even starting to see governments looking to change from traditional DB to CB

| 2023 Sample | AGE | 401(K) PROFIT <br> SHARING ONLY | 401(K) AND CASH <br> BALANCE PLANS |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Maximum | 40 | 66,000 | 180,000 |
| Contributions | 50 | 73,500 | 261,500 |

*actual maximum may be lower if compensation is less than $\$ 330,000$

## Valued Client

A Combination 401(k)/ Profit Sharing/ Cash Balance Plan
For the Plan Year 01/01/2022-12/31/2022 CONTRIBUTION REPORT - DETAIL

| P O H | Last Name | First Name | AA | RA | Considered Earnings | Cash Balance |  | 401(k) <br> Deferral | Profit Sharing |  | Total Contribution |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | ployer |  | \% of |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | Amount | \% |  | Amount | \% | Amount | \% | Cost | \% | Total |
| A | Owner |  | 55 |  | 305,000 | 222,253 | 72.9 |  | 27,000 | 6,100 | 2.0 | 255,353 | 83.7 | 228,353 | 74.9 | 100.0 |

Legend: P-Principal, O- Owner, H- Highly Compensated Employee

## CONTRIBUTION REPORT - SUMMARY

|  | Considered Earnings | Cash Balance |  | 401(k) <br> Deferral | Profit Sharing |  | Total Contribution |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Employer |  |  | \% of <br> Total |
|  |  | Amount | \% |  | Amount | \% |  | Amount | \% | Cost | \% |
| Principals | 305,000 | 222,253 | 72.9 |  | 27,000 | 6,100 | 2.0 | 255,353 | 83.7 | 228,353 | 74.9 | 100.0 |
| Grand Total | 305,000 | 222,253 | 72.9 | 27,000 | 6,100 | 2.0 | 255,353 | 83.7 | 228,353 | 74.9 | 100.0 |

## Valued Client

A Combination 401(k)/ Profit Sharing/ Cash Balance Plan
For the Plan Year 01/01/2022-12/31/2022
CONTRIBUTION REPORT - DETAIL


Legend: P-Principal, O- Owner, H- Highly Compensated Employee
CONTRIBUTION REPORT - SUMMARY

|  | Considered Earnings | Cash Balance |  | 401(k) <br> Deferral | Profit Sharing |  | Total Contribution |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Employer |  |  | \% of |
|  |  | Amount | \% |  | Amount | \% | Amount | \% | Cost | \% | Total |
| Principals | 305,000 | 426,450 | 139.8 |  | 27,000 | 18,300 | 6.0 | 471,750 | 154.7 | 444,750 | 145.8 | 100.0 |
| Grand Total | 305,000 | 426,450 | 139.8 | 27,000 | 18,300 | 6.0 | 471,750 | 154.7 | 444,750 | 145.8 | 100.0 |

Note: Cash balance credit for 2022 assumes 1 year of pre-participation service and compensation for those years are at the 401(a)(17) maximum.
Note: Pre-funding contribution total $\$ 194,474$ and the 2022 cash balance credit is $\$ 222,253$.

## Benefit to Owners = \$462,899

Total Deductible Contribution $=\$ 516,647$
Est. Tax Savings (42\%) = \$216,991
Cost to Staff = \$53,748
Est. Net Savings = \$163,243

## Valued Client - 2023 PLAN YEAR

## A Combination 401(k)/ Profit Sharing/ Cash Balance Plan

For the Plan Year 01/01/2023-12/31/2023
CONTRIBUTION REPORT - DETAIL

| P O H | Class | Last Name | First Name | AA | RA | Considered Earnings | Cash Balance |  | 401(k) <br> Deferral | 401(m) <br> Match | Profit Sharing |  | Total Contribution |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | Amount |  |  |  | Employer |  | \% | $\% \text { of }$Total |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  | Amount | \% |  |  | Amount | \% | \% | Cost |  |  |
| * * * | A | Owner |  | 66 | 66 | 330,000 | 337,699 | 102.3 | 30,000 | 13,200 | 0 | 0.0 | 380,899 | 115.4 | 350,899 | 106.3 | 76.8 |
| * * | C | Spouse |  | 62 | 65 | 50,000 | 50,000 | 100.0 | 30,000 | 2,000 | 0 | 0.0 | 82,000 | 164.0 | 52,000 | 104.0 | 11.4 |
|  | B | EE1 |  | 29 | 65 | 37,391 | 935 | 2.5 | 2,437 | 1,496 | 2,524 | 6.8 | 7,392 | 19.8 | 4,954 | 13.3 | 1.1 |
|  | B | EE2 |  | 54 | 65 | 66,375 | 1,659 | 2.5 | 788 | 788 | 4,480 | 6.8 | 7,715 | 11.6 | 6,927 | 10.4 | 1.5 |
|  | B | EE3 |  | 45 | 65 | 33,000 | 825 | 2.5 | 0 | 0 | 2,228 | 6.8 | 3,053 | 9.3 | 3,053 | 9.3 | 0.7 |
|  | B | EE4 |  | 42 | 65 | 44,662 | 1,117 | 2.5 | 0 | 0 | 3,015 | 6.8 | 4,131 | 9.3 | 4,131 | 9.3 | 0.9 |
|  | B | EE5 |  | 66 | 66 | 21,300 | 533 | 2.5 | 0 | 0 | 1,438 | 6.8 | 1,970 | 9.3 | 1,970 | 9.3 | 0.4 |
|  | B | EE6 |  | 30 | 65 | 29,901 | 748 | 2.5 | 1,495 | 1,196 | 2,018 | 6.8 | 5,457 | 18.3 | 3,962 | 13.2 | 0.9 |
|  | B | EE7 |  | 45 | 65 | 55,513 | 1,388 | 2.5 | 1,665 | 1,665 | 3,747 | 6.8 | 8,466 | 15.2 | 6,800 | 12.2 | 1.5 |
|  | B | EE8 |  | 46 | 65 | 45,922 | 1,148 | 2.5 | 2,265 | 1,821 | 3,100 | 6.8 | 8,334 | 18.1 | 6,069 | 13.2 | 1.3 |
|  | B | EE9 |  | 29 | 65 | 39,445 | 986 | 2.5 | 1,183 | 1,183 | 2,663 | 6.8 | 6,015 | 15.2 | 4,832 | 12.2 | 1.1 |
|  | B | EE10 |  | 55 | 65 | 32,733 | 818 | 2.5 | 0 | 0 | 2,209 | 6.8 | 3,028 | 9.3 | 3,028 | 9.3 | 0.7 |
|  | B | EE11 |  | 31 | 65 | 35,834 | 896 | 2.5 | 389 | 389 | 2,419 | 6.8 | 4,093 | 11.4 | 3,704 | 10.3 | 0.8 |
|  | B | EE12 |  | 58 | 65 | 46,685 | 1,167 | 2.5 | 0 | 0 | 3,151 | 6.8 | 4,318 | 9.3 | 4,318 | 9.3 | 0.9 |

Legend: P- Principal, O- Owner, H- Highly Compensated Employee

CONTRIBUTION REPORT - SUMMARY

|  | Considered <br> Earnings | Cash Balance |  | 401(k) <br> Deferral | 401(m) <br> Match | Total Contribution |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Profit Sharing |  | Employer |  |  |  | \% of Total |
|  |  | Amount | \% |  |  | Amount | \% | Amount | \% |  | Cost | \% |
| Principals | 380,000 | 387,699 | 102.0 |  | 60,000 | 15,200 | 0 | 0.0 | 462,899 | 121.8 | 402,899 | 106.0 | 88.2 |
| Non-Principals | 488,759 | 12,219 | 2.5 | 10,222 | 8,538 | 32,991 | 6.8 | 63,971 | 13.1 | 53,748 | 11.0 | 11.8 |
| Grand Total | 868,759 | 399,918 | 46.0 | 70,222 | 23,738 | 32,991 | 3.8 | 526,869 | 60.6 | 456,647 | 52.6 | 100.0 |

## Interest Crediting Rates - History

- Before 2006, had to use 30 -year treasury rate as interest crediting rate
- After PPA (2006), can use other interest crediting rates with treasury to define what is available
- 2010 Regulations, IRS started to define what rates are available and what is not acceptable


## Interest Crediting Rates

- Can use a fixed rate up to $6 \%$
- Can use a bond related index (including 30-year treasury bond yield)
- Can use an equity index or mutual fund return or return on plan assets (with some limitations)
- Cumulative interest credits cannot be negative


## Interest Crediting Rates



- Lots of options but only a low fixed rate or low bond rate make sense for most plans
- Generally best plan design is a low fixed rate (between $3 \%$ and $5 \%$ )
- Can't go too low for most plans without needing to increase staff benefits to satisfy minimum participation and meaningful benefits
- Contribution cost for staff is predictable
- Maximum lump sum benefits and maximum contributions are available
- 30-year treasury rate with a cap so that it doesn't go over $5.50 \%$ would be next best


## Cash Balance Plan Designs - Future

- Online access to Cash Balance Plan benefits
- Platforms that could show both $401(\mathrm{k})$ and CB plan benefits together
- Or separate online access showing CB plan benefits
- Note that the participant interest in CB plan is in the benefits and is not tied directly to actual asset allocation
- Caution - bells and whistles should not be chosen over solid plan design and expertise
- Tax reform and retirement crisis
- Both likely to continue to make CB plans attractive and popular
- Employee appreciation of pension benefit and annuity payout options likely to increase


## Cash Balance Plan Statement Details

- Participant A
- Beginning Cash Balance $=\$ 100,000$
- Interest Credit (4.50\%) $=\$ 4,500$
- Cash Balance Allocation $=\$ 100,000$
- Ending Cash Balance $=\$ 204,500$
- Participant B
- Beginning Cash Balance $=\$ 1,000$
- Interest Credit (4.50\%) = \$45
- Cash Balance Allocation $=\$ 1,000$
- Ending Cash Balance $=\$ 2,045$


## Cash Balance Accounts

- Cash Balance accounts are hypothetical accounts
- Plan investments are TRUSTEE DIRECTED and invested in a SINGLE ASSET POOL
- The value of Cash Balance accounts are usually not exactly equal to the value of Plan Assets


## Cash Balance Account Values vs. Plan Asset Values

- If Plan Assets perform better than Cash Balance interest credit
- Reduce future deposits or
- Allocate additional assets to participants with amendment or
- Make no current change


## Cash Balance Account Values vs. Plan Asset Values

- If Plan Assets perform worse than Cash Balance interest credit
- Increase future contributions or
- Amend plan to reduce future allocations to allow plan assets to catch up or
- Make no current change


## Example of Cash Balance Plan Funding Management

- 2021
- Cash Balance benefit values $=\$ 2.65 \mathrm{~mm}$
- YE asset value $=\$ 2.60 \mathrm{~mm}$
- $100 \%$ Funded amount $=\$ 50,000$
- 2022
- Cash Balance benefit values $=\$ 3 \mathrm{~mm}$
- Market Loss $=\$ 450 \mathrm{k}$
- YE asset value $=\$ 2.2 \mathrm{~mm}$
- $80 \%$ Minimum Funding Required $=\$ 200 \mathrm{~K}$ (ending assets $=\$ 2.4 \mathrm{~mm}$ )


## Example of Cash Balance Plan Funding Management



- 2023 - Freeze Plan
- Reduce Allocation to ZERO before 1000 hours
- YE 2023 estimated CB benefit values $=\$ 3.12 \mathrm{~mm}$ (4\% interest credit)
- 2023 funding goal (actual \& market) $=\$ 720 \mathrm{k}$
- Projected 100\% Funded
- 2023 - Amend Plan to increase allocation back to desired level (at any time before $3 / 15 / 2024$ )


## Cash Balance Plan Contribution Range Communication

- Minimum Required Contribution $=$ actuarially calculated amount needed to be contributed for year in order to avoid $10 \%$ excise tax on funding deficiency (calculated using IRS prescribed interest rates)
- $100 \%$ Funding Contribution $=$ contribution amount that would bring plan assets $=$ value of Cash Balance accounts
- Maximum Deductible Contribution $=$
- If combined plan $31 \%$ limit applies...amount to bring total company contribution to this limit or
- If combined plan limit does not apply $=150 \%$ value of benefits at beginning of year plus $100 \%$ value of benefits accruing during year less value of plan assets (calculated using IRS prescribed interest rates)


## IRS Minimum Funding Calculation



- Amount that satisfies IRS minimum funding is always less than the amount that brings plan assets to $100 \%$ of Cash Balance benefit values
- Due to amortization of shortfall over 7 years instead of 1 and
- Value of benefits for IRS minimum funding purposes is less than real Cash Balance benefit values [due to difference between interest credit and IRS prescribed rates for funding (which are higher)]


## What about Contribution Flexibility?

- Usually, a range from minimum required to maximum deductible
- Can always amend plan up until 2.5 months after year end to increase benefits (Section 412(c)(8) amendment) and consider in funding for year
- Can freeze plan or amend to lower allocation before 1000 -hour point in year (i.e., can lower contribution requirement on a prospective basis only)
- Consider using Profit Sharing and $401(\mathrm{k})$ as flexible part of design


## Managing Cash Balance Plan Funding

- Best way to manage funding is to focus on funding to $100 \%$ of Cash Balance benefit values when possible
- This will ensure the IRS minimum funding is met (and will build up a prefunding balance that could be used in bad years).


# Cash <br> Balance <br> Plan Asset 

- Proper investment allocation depends upon plan particulars but:
- Very little downside to being always conservative and
- Importance of conservative allocation increases as plan benefits grow compared to annual allocation / expected contribution
- Potential downside risk to being too aggressive and little upside to aggressive allocation since ultimate maximum lump sum is limited


## Investment Allocation

## Cash

## Balance Plan

- 


## Interest

Crediting
Rate

- Older plans may use 30 year treasury yields as interest crediting rate
- Although contemplated by regulations and promoted by some, setting interest crediting rate equal to a market based or plan return based index does not make sense
- Can cause severe reduction in maximum lump sum benefit limits
- Severe Employee contribution cost fluctuation


## Pairing 401 (k) Profit Sharing Plans and Cash Balance Plans



- Usually works better (i.e., more cost effective) to have both 401(k) Profit Sharing Plan and Cash Balance Plan than standalone Cash Balance Plan (significant higher cost without combined testing)
- Usually tested together for non-discrimination (3\% Safe Harbor, Profit Sharing and Cash Balance Plan benefits)


## Pairing 401 (k) Profit Sharing Plans and Cash Balance Plans



- 401(k) and Profit Sharing add to flexibility
- Common design for Staff is:
- At least $5 \%$ of comp. in $401(\mathrm{k})$ Plan (Safe Harbor, Match, or Profit Sharing)
- $2.50 \%$ of comp. in Cash Balance Plan
- Profit Sharing can be vested over 6 years / Cash Balance over 3 years


## Combined Plan Deduction Limits

- If company $401(\mathrm{k})$ Plan contributions are more than $6 \%$ of total compensation, then maximum combined contribution deduction limited to $31 \%$ of compensation ( $25 \%$ plus $6 \%$ )
- If company $401(\mathrm{k})$ Plan contributions are less than $6 \%$ of total participant compensation, then combined plan limit ( $31 \%$ ) does not apply
- Combined plan limit also does not apply if DB plan is covered by PBGC


# Other <br> Testing and Compliance Issues 

- Top Heavy usually satisfied in DC Plan with $5 \%$ company contribution (less expensive than top heavy minimum DB benefit).
- Cash Balance or Defined Benefit Plan must provide meaningful benefits to at least $40 \%$ of non excludable employees
- Must satisfy minimum contribution gateway if testing DC / CB together on benefits basis (usually $7.5 \%$ combined between DC and CB Plan).


## DB and CB Plan Annual Communication



- Actuarial Valuation Report and Participant Statements
- Combined Plan Allocation Summary
- PBGC Premium Filing (if applicable)
- Form 5500 and Schedule SB after all contribution deposits made
- Adjusted Funding Target Attainment Percentage (AFTAP) (prepared at same time as Schedule SB)
- Required to be provided to Plan Sponsor by Pension Protection Act.


## DB and CB Plan Annual Communication



- Plan Sponsor Elections for treatment of prefunding balances, funding interest rate choices (prepared at same time as Schedule SB
- Benefit Options Chart prepared for terminated participant (upon request)


## Defined Benefit and

 CashBalance Plan

## Benefit

 Options- Must offer annuity forms of payment
- Actuary calculates Lump Sum, Single life annuity, Joint life and $50 \%$ survivor annuity, Joint life and $75 \%$ survivor annuity, and Joint Life and 100\% Survivor Annuity
- Extremely rare for participant to elect an annuity
- If it happens, either pay monthly amount from plan or purchase single premium annuity from Insurance Company


## Pension Benefit Guaranty Corporation (PBGC)



- May be subject to coverage by, premium payment to, and filing to Pension Benefit Guaranty Corporation (PBGC)
- Covered by PBGC if CB or DB Plans:
- Cover non owners and
- Are not professional service employers (i.e., not office of physicians, dentists, CPAs, attorneys, engineers, etc.) or
- Are professional service employers but have more than 25 participants in plan


## PBGC

- Fixed Rate Premium $=\$ 96$ Per Participant Per Year plus
- Variable Rate Premium $=5.2 \%$ of excess of value of vested benefits over value of plan assets (it is unusual for the variable rate premium to apply to small plans or plans of professional service employers)
- Annual Filing is due 10 months after plan year ends (i.e., Filing for calendar year plans is due October $15^{\text {th }}$ )


## What to

 avoid- Floor Offset Plan Designs - they are not what they are sold to be
- Fully Insured Plans (412(i) / 412(d)(3)) If insurance is needed, Cash Balance Plans can include life insurance without the baggage and scrutiny that a fully insured plan brings
- Funding only minimum required
- Excluding employees


# Who is a good candidate? 

- Want more than $\$ 60 \mathrm{~K}$ contribution for some physician(s) or owners(s) (and have cash flow)
- Can contribute at least $7.50 \%$ of compensation for staff
- Helps to have some employees that are younger than owners (Note that does not mean that all employees need be young)
- Staff payroll per physician or owner is not too high


## Decision Making Process

- Does it make economic sense?
- Are key individuals receiving enough of the total contribution increase?
- Is Cash Flow significant for additional contributions (and relatively consistent)?
- Are owners okay with Trustee Directed Investments?


## Thank you!

## Judd Depew President

The Pension Design Group
760 Lakeview Plaza Boulevard, Suite 700
Worthington, OH 43085
614.264.4676
judd@pensiondesigngroup.com


[^0]:    *Source - 2020 National Cash Balance Plan Research Report

